

DO-IT-YOURSELF Guide to Democracy Audit

Dear participant

First of all we take this opportunity to thank you for participating in this Democracy Audit. It is a relatively simple exercise, which is planned not to take you more than an hour to complete.

The idea of Democracy Audit is to measure the state of democracy in all the countries where **MS** Danish Association for International Co-operation is operating, and in the coming years to add other countries. The aim of Democracy Audit is to generate and facilitate debate on democracy and to create public awareness about democracy with special attention to how democracy involves and works for poor people. We believe, that considering and answering the questions and afterwards discussing them with others, is in itself a useful learning process.

In each country **MS** will prepare a report on the state of democracy in the country, based on the questionnaires, comments and workshop discussions. Moreover, **MS** will prepare an international report based on the national reports. Together with the national reports, the international report will serve as an important instrument for highlighting central features, problems and improvements in the development of democracy and will inform our efforts to promote democracy involving poor people and fighting poverty. The reports will prepare the ground for our advocacy and information activities related to democracy in Denmark and at the international level.

Democracy is a political concept, where the key democratic principles are those of popular control over public decisions and decision-makers, and *political equality* irrespective of gender, ethnic, national, cultural, social or economic status. For **MS** the focus is especially on how democracy affects poor people, minorities and underprivileged. We believe that democracy is not only a goal in itself; it is also a means to fight poverty. Therefore, we ask you to answer the questions with a view to how democracy involves and works for poor and marginalised people in your country.

The main focus is on the 16 italicized questions at the top of each page in the questionnaire. The research questions below are supposed to be guidelines for you to answer the main question, so by rating these, you will automatically answer the main question. During the exercise you just make each judgement as it comes and simply tick your provisional assessment under each research question. The most that is asked for, however, is your impressionistic, personal judgement (or "best guess"), which may be further developed in discussion with the rest of your group at the workshop.

The intention with this questionnaire is that you check off the questions on the following pages and consider the best and worst features of your country's state of democracy. We ask you to answer the questions according to your own personal experiences and opinions, and from a practical, as opposed to a judicial, point of view. Your answers should not reflect a comparison with other countries or with an idealistic notion of democracy. They should reflect your own opinion based on your experiences with democracy in your country - especially with a view to how democracy involves and works for poor people. Afterwards, at the workshop, we would like you to discuss your answers with the other participants and agree upon a joint answer for each question.

If you do not feel sure how to answer one of the research questions you simply tick the **Don't Know** box on the right. It is important that you don't answer if you are not sure of the meaning of the question. Instead we request you to discuss it with your group at the workshop.

The lines with **best feature**, **most serious problem** and **suggested improvement** at the end of each section will assist your judgement. They are meant for you to write down your own notes or reflections to the questions, which you might want to discuss at the workshop with your group.

The rating of the research questions is classified in boxes as follows:

Very High High Medium Low Very Low

Don't Know

As an example, under question 1.1., if you consider that there are serious exclusions on rights on citizenship in your country, then you might tick Low for your assessment of the level of inclusiveness of citizenship entitlements. The numbering of the boxes corresponds to the relevant research questions on the list.

We thank you again for your time and for your help. The most genuine regards,



MS Danish Association for International Co-operation

Borgergade 14 1300 Copenhagen K Denmark www.ms.dk/democracy

Original audit and questionnaire developed by:

- Human Rights Centre, University of Essex, Wivenhoe Park, Colchester, Essex CO4 3SQ, England
- International IDEA, Strömsborg, SE-103 34 Stockholm, Sweden

And in all fairness adapted by:

- MS Danish Association for International Co-operation, Borgergade 14, 1300 København K, Denmark www.ms.dk

Democracy Audi

I. Citizenship, Law and Rights

1. Citizenship. (Note1)

Main question: Is there public agreement on a common citizenship without discrimination?

- How inclusive is the political nation and state citizenship of all who live within the territory? 1.1.
- 1.2. How far are cultural differences acknowledged, and how well are minorities protected?
- 1.3. How much agreement is there on state boundaries and constitutional arrangements?
- How far do constitutional and political arrangements enable major societal divisions to be reduced or accepted?
- **1.5.** How fair and inclusive are the procedures for amending the constitution?

| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Know |
|---------------|-----------|------|--------|-----|----------|------------|
| 1.1. | | | | | | |
| 1.2. | | | | | | |
| 1.3. | | | | | | |
| 1.4. | | | | | | |
| 1.5. | | | | | | |
| Best Feature: | | | | | | |

Most serious problem:

Notes: Citizenship: Invokes the idea that there should be mutual respect between the different communities or identities that make up the nation and that all citizens must enjoy effective equal rights under the law. The idea of citizenship also invokes the notion on how immigrants and refugees are treated and how the possibilities are to achieve citizenship.

2. The rule of law and access to justice. (Note²)

Main question: Are state and society consistently subject to the law?

- **2.1.** How far is the rule of law functioning throughout the territory?
- **2.2.** To what extent are all public officials subject to the rule of law and to transparent rules in the performance of their functions?
- **2.3.** How independent are the courts and the judiciary from the executive, and how free are they from all kinds of interference? (**Note** ³)
- 2.4. How equal and secure is the access to justice and fair process for all citizens?
- 2.5. How equal and secure is the access to complain in the event of maladministration for all citizens?
- **2.6.** How far do the criminal justice and punitive systems observe due rules of impartial and fair treatment in their operations?
- 2.7. How much confidence do people have in the legal system to deliver fair and effective justice?

| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Know |
|----------------|-----------------|------|--------|-----|----------|------------|
| 2.1. | | | | | | |
| 2.2. | | | | | | |
| 2.3. | | | | | | |
| 2.4. | | | | | | |
| 2.5. | | | | | | |
| 2.6. | | | | | | |
| 2.7. | | | | | | |
| Best Feature: | | | | | | |
| Most serious p | <u>vroblem:</u> | | | | | |
| Suggested imp | rovement: | | | | | |

² **Notes:** Rule of law: Expresses the idea that law - not the arbitrary will of people, whether in government or not - should rule society. It also comprises that no person should be above the law.

³ **Notes:** The division of powers by function: The <u>legislative</u> has the power to make and change laws, the <u>executive</u> have the power to put laws into action, and the <u>judiciary</u> is the country's legal system. It is essential in a democracy that the three powers are separated.

| | il and political riuestion: Are civil and | | in practise eq | ually guarante | ed for all? | |
|--------------|---|------|----------------|----------------|--|------------|
| 3.1. 3.2. | • | | | • | and from fear of it? novement, expression, associ | ation |
| 3.3. 3.4. | | | | _ | n, language or culture? d groups working to improve h | numan |
| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Know |
| 3.1. | | | | | | |
| 3.2. | | | | | | |

Best Feature:

3.3.

3.4.

Most serious problem:

4. Economic and social rights.

Main question: Are economic and social rights equally guaranteed for all?

- **4.1.** How far is access to work or social security available to all, without discrimination?
- 4.2. How effectively are the basic necessities of life guaranteed, including food, shelter and clean water?
- **4.3.** To what extent is the health of the population protected, in all spheres and stages of life?
- **4.4.** How extensive and inclusive is the right to education, including education in the rights and r esponsibilities of citizenship?
- **4.5.** How free are trade unions and other work-related associations to organise and represent their members' interests?
- **4.6.** How rigorous, exact and transparent are the rules on corporate governance and how effectively are corporations regulated in the public interest?

| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Know |
|--------------|-----------|------|--------|-----|----------|------------|
| 4.1. | | | | | | |
| 4.2. | | | | | | |
| 4.3. | | | | | | |
| 4.4. | | | | | | |
| 4.5. | | | | | | |
| 4.6. | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| Doot Footure | _ | | | | | |

Best Feature:

Most serious problem:

II. Representative and Accountable Government (Note⁴)

5. Free and fair elections.

Main question: Do elections give the people control over governments and their policies?

- **5.1.** How far is appointment to governmental and legislative office determined by popular competitive election, and how frequently do elections lead to change in the governing parties or personnel?
- **5.2.** How inclusive and accessible for all citizens are the registration and voting procedures?
- **5.3.** How independent are the registration and voting procedures of government and party control, and how free from intimidation, threats and abuse?
- **5.4.** How fair are the procedures for the registration of candidates and parties, and how far is there fair access for them to the media and other means of communication with the voters?
- **5.5.** How wide a range of choice does the electoral and party system allow the voters, how equally do their votes count, and how closely does the composition of the legislature and the selection of the executive reflect the choices they make?
- **5.6.** How far does the legislature reflect the social composition of the electorate? (**Note**⁵)
- **5.7.** How far are the election results accepted by all political forces in the country and outside?

| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Know |
|---------------|------------|------|--------|-----|----------|------------|
| 5.1. | | | | | | |
| 5.2. | | | | | | |
| 5.3. | | | | | | |
| 5.4. | | | | | | |
| 5.5. | | | | | | |
| 5.6. | | | | | | |
| 5.7. | | | | | | |
| Best Feature: | | | | | | |
| Most serious | problem: | | | | | |
| Suggested im | provement: | | | | | |

⁴ **Notes**: Effectiveness and accountability: It is crucial in a democracy that citizens are able to judge not only how well government has performed, but also its honesty and other qualities. Therefore must the government be accountable to the people both between elections, before and after them, as well as at them. Making government accountable is also vital to making government effective. Accountability means that government, ministers and state officials are bound to be open to citizens and the media etc. about their conduct and performance, so that it is possible to judge them.

⁵ **Notes**: Legislature: The legislature is the authority who has the power to make and change laws. In this question we want you to focus on how the legislature reflects the social interests instead of which people is represented.

| 6. Democra | atic role | e of politic | cal parties. |
|------------|-----------|--------------|--------------|
|------------|-----------|--------------|--------------|

Main question: Does the party system assist the working of democracy? (Note⁶)

6.1. How freely are parties able to form and recruit members, engage with the public and campaign for office? 6.2. How effective is the party system in forming and sustaining governments in office? 6.3. How free are opposition or non-governing parties to organise within the legislature, and how effectively do they contribute to government accountability? 6.4. How fair and effective are the rules governing party discipline in the legislature? 6.5. How far are parties effective membership organisations, and how far are members able to influence party policy and candidate selection? 6.6. How far does the system of party financing prevent the subordination of parties to special interests? 6.7. To what extent do parties cross ethnic, social, religious and linguistic divisions?

| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Know |
|------|-----------|------|--------|-----|----------|------------|
| 6.1. | | | | | | |
| 6.2. | | | | | | |
| 6.3. | | | | | | |
| 6.4. | | | | | | |
| 6.5. | | | | | | |
| 6.6. | | | | | | |
| 6.7. | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |

Best Feature:

Most serious problem:

Notes: The party system and its democratic role: The political parties help simplify the electoral choice by offering broad policy positions and programmes between which to choose; they also make clear who is accountable in the event of policy failure. Simplifying electoral choice can readily lead to a loss of pluralism as significant voices are marginalised and new parties find it hard to gain a foothold. The risk is that parties feel tempted to subordinate themselves to the special interests of wealthy donors.

7. Government effectiveness and accountability.

Main question: Is government accountable to the people and their representatives?

- **7.1.** How far is the elected government able to influence or control those matters that are important to the lives of the citizens, and how well is it informed, organised and resourced to do so?
- **7.2.** How much public confidence is there in the effectiveness of government and its political leadership?
- **7.3.** How effective and open to investigation is the control exercised by elected leaders and their ministers over their administrative staff and other executive agencies? (**Note**⁷)
- **7.4.** How extensive and effective are the powers of the legislature to initiate, investigate and change legislation?
- **7.5.** How extensive and effective are the powers of the legislature to investigate the executive and hold it to account?
- **7.6.** How rigorous are the procedures for approval and supervision of taxation and public expenditure?
- **7.7.** How comprehensive and effective is legislation giving citizens the right of access to government information?

| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Kno |
|------------------------------|------------|------|--------|-----|----------|-----------|
| 7.1. | | | | | | |
| 7.2. | | | | | | |
| 7.3. | | | | | | |
| 7.4. | | | | | | |
| 7.5. | | | | | | |
| 7.6. | | | | | | |
| 7.7. | | | | | | |
| Best Feature: . Most serious | | | | | | |
| Suggested im | provement: | | | | | |

Note: Staff in the public service may be employed civil servants, politically appointed, or elected. Some may, therefore, be replaced when a new government is appointed while others may continue. Whatever the case, it is equally important that a democracy ensures transparent and effective control with this staff so that they do not abuse their position.

8. Civilian control of the military and police.

Main question: Are the military and police forces under civilian control?

- **8.1.** How effective is civilian control over the armed forces, and how free is political life from military involvement?
- 8.2 How publicly accountable are the police and security services for their activities?
- **8.3**. How far does the composition of the army, police and security services reflect the social composition of society at large?
- **8.4.** How free is the country from the operation of paramilitary units, private armies, warlordism and criminal mafias?

| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Know |
|------|-----------|------|--------|-----|----------|------------|
| 8.1. | | | | | | |
| 8.2. | | | | | | |
| 8.3. | | | | | | |
| 8.4. | | | | | | |

Best Feature:

Most serious problem:

9. Minimising corruption.

Main question: Are public officials free from corruption? (Note8)

- **9.1.** How effective is the separation of public office from the personal business and family interests of office holders?
- **9.2.** How effective are the arrangements for protecting office holders and the public from involvement in corruption?
- **9.3.** How far do the rules and procedures for financing elections, candidates and elected representatives prevent their subordination to personal or sectional interests?
- **9.4.** How far is the influence of powerful corporations and business interests over public policy kept in check, and how free are they from involvement in corruption, including overseas?
- **9.5.** How much confidence do people have that public officials and public services are free from corruption?

| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Know |
|------|-----------|------|--------|-----|----------|------------|
| 9.1. | | | | | | |
| 9.2. | | | | | | |
| 9.3. | | | | | | |
| 9.4. | | | | | | |
| 9.5. | | | | | | |

Best Feature:

Most serious problem:

III. Civil society and popular participation

10. The media in a democratic society.

Main question: Do the media operate in a way that sustains democratic values?

- **10.1.** How independent are the media from government, how pluralistic is their ownership, and how free are they from subordination to foreign governments or multinational companies?
- **10.2.** How representative are the media of different opinions and how accessible are they to different sections of society?
- **10.3.** How effective are the media in investigating government and powerful corporations?
- **10.4.** How free are journalists from restrictive laws, harassment and intimidation?
- **10.5.** How free are private citizens from intrusion and harassment by the media?

| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Know |
|-------|-----------|------|--------|-----|----------|------------|
| 10.1. | | | | | | |
| 10.2. | | | | | | |
| 10.3. | | | | | | |
| 10.4. | | | | | | |
| 10.5. | П | П | П | П | П | П |

| Rest | Feature: |
|------|-----------|
| DUSE | i cataic. |

Most serious problem:

11. Political participation.

Main question: Is there full citizen participation in public life? (Note9)

- **11.1.** How widespread is the range of voluntary associations, citizen groups, social movements etc. and how independent are they from government? (**Note**¹⁰)
- **11.2.** How extensive is citizen participation in voluntary associations and self-management organisations, and in other voluntary public activity?
- **11.3.** How far do women participate in political life and public office at all levels?
- **11.4.** How equal is access for all social groups to public office, and how fairly are they represented within it?
- **11.5.** To what extend does access to civic education and knowledge of one's rights to participate exist?

| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Know |
|-------|-----------|------|--------|-----|----------|------------|
| 11.1. | | | | | | |
| 11.2. | | | | | | |
| 11.3. | | | | | | |
| 11.4. | | | | | | |
| 11.5. | | | | | | |

| В | Зe | S | t | F | e | a | t | u | r | e | : |
|---|----|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

Most serious problem:

Suggested improvement:

Democracy Audi

⁹ **Notes:** In this question we want you to focus both on participation at local and central levels in society.

Notes: <u>Voluntary</u>: By voluntary means that a person is taking part in a not-for-profit activity or group with the potential for affecting public policy, public service delivery, the conditions of community life or related public opinion. So in a broad sense some people might receive some kind of payment for their work, but this must not be the primary goal.

12. Government responsiveness.

Main question: Is government responsive to the concerns of its citizens?

- **12.1.** How open and systematic are the procedures for public consultation on government policy and legislation, and how equal is the access for relevant interests to government?
- **12.2.** How accessible are elected representatives to their constituents?
- **12.3.** How accessible and reliable are public services for those who need them, and how systematic is consultation with users over service delivery?
- **12.4.** How much confidence do people have in the ability of government to solve the main problems con fronting society, and in their own ability to influence it?

| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Know |
|-------|-----------|------|--------|-----|----------|------------|
| 12.1. | | | | | | |
| 12.2. | | | | | | |
| 12.3. | | | | | | |
| 12.4. | | | | | | |

Best Feature:

Most serious problem:

13. Decentralisation. (Note11)

Main question: Are decisions taken at the level of government, which is most appropriate for the people affected?

- **13.1.** How independent are the sub-central tiers of government from the centre, and how far do they have the powers and resources to carry out their responsibilities? (**Note**¹²)
- **13.2.** How far are the sub-central tiers of government subject to free and fair electoral authorisation, and to the criteria of openness, accountability and responsiveness in their work?
- **13.3.** How extensive is the co-operation of government at the most local level with relevant partners, as sociations and communities in the formation and implementation of policy, and in service provision?

| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Know |
|-------|-----------|------|--------|-----|----------|------------|
| 13.1. | | | | | | |
| 13.2. | | | | | | |
| 13.3. | | | | | | |

Best Feature:

Most serious problem:

Notes: Decentralisation: The governmental centre has to act to secure and advance the well-being of the whole people and to make sure that no parts of the territory are disadvantaged by an unequal distribution of resources between them. At the same time, the centre must allow devolved institutions sufficient autonomy in the exercise of their powers and in the use of resources to meet the needs and aspirations of their populations.

¹² **Notes:** Sub-central tiers: Covers for example village, municipality, county and district offices.

IV. Democracy beyond the State

Suggested improvement:

14. International dimensions of democracy.

Main question: Are the country's external relations conducted in accordance with democratic norms, and is it itself free from external subordination?

- **14.1.** How free is the government of the country from subordination to external agencies, economic, cultural or political?
- **14.2.** How far are government relations with international organisations based on principles of partnership and transparency?
- 14.3. How far does the government support UN human rights treaties and respect international law?
- **14.4.** How far does the government respect its international obligations in its treatment of refugees, immigrants and asylum seekers, and how free from arbitrary discrimination is its immigration policy?
- **14.5.** How consistent is the government in its support for human rights and democracy abroad?
- **14.6.** How far do decisions on external relations, affiliations, subordinations and consents to international treaties and organisations, involve open public debate, consultation and / or referenda?

| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Know |
|---------------|-----------------|------|--------|-----|----------|------------|
| 14.1. | | | | | | |
| 14.2. | | | | | | |
| 14.3. | | | | | | |
| 14.4. | | | | | | |
| 14.5. | | | | | | |
| 14.6. | | | | | | |
| Best Feature: | | | | | | |
| Most serious | <u>problem:</u> | | | | | |

V. Poverty and Democracy

15. Poverty reduction through democracy. (Note 13)

Main question: Policy formulation and debate: Is poverty reduction a key political objective and are the poor themselves participating in policy formulation?

- **15.1.** How prominently does poverty reduction appear as a declared political objective e.g. in the form of a national poverty eradication plan and, if so, does the plan reflect the realities?
- **15.2.** How open and inclusive is the formulation of policies and plans to reduce poverty and to which extent are poor and marginalised groups able to influence them?
- **15.3.** To which extent does the public debate e.g. in the media and in political campaigns focus on aspects of poverty and means to reduce poverty?
- **15.4.** How inclusive is the political system in practice in terms of giving real access for all including the poorest, women, marginalised, and most vulnerable to exercise their political rights and actively participate in policy formulation and decision making? (**Note** ¹⁴)

| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Know |
|----------------------------|-------------|------|--------|-----|----------|------------|
| 15.1. | | | | | | |
| 15.2. | | | | | | |
| 15.3. | | | | | | |
| 15.4. | | | | | | |
| Best Feature Most serious | | | | | | |
| Suggested in | mprovement: | | | | | |

Notes: The previous sections have dealt with the political system and its functionality. This section mainly deals with the willingness and ability of the political system to actually ensure reduction of poverty. Poverty is here seen as multi-dimensional including economic, human (basic needs), political, socio-cultural (social status and dignity), and protective capabilities for individuals and groups.

Notes: Inclusiveness of the political system: Can be achieved through direct representation or through peoples' own organizations and representatives. It is important to consider whether location, education, financial means, social/ethnic affiliation or other circumstances in practice prevent poor people from organising themselves or participate in debates, elections etc.

16. Poverty reduction in practice.

Main question: Has it been possible to actually reduce poverty over the past 5-10 years with the present democratic state of the political system?

- **16.1.** To which extent has the income distribution over recent years changed in terms of narrowing the gap between the rich and poor and reducing the number of people living below the poverty line?
- **16.2.** How effective, comprehensive and transparent is the taxation system and how far has various forms of tax and levies (personal, corporate, property, consumption etc.) been balanced during recent years in a manner which ensures that they are proportionate to the ability to pay?
- **16.3.** To which extent has equal and affordable access for all social groups to health, education, water, and other basic services been improved?
- **16.4.** How effective and transparent has public expenditure been in improving social provision and status for the most vulnerable groups and marginal areas during the past 10 years?
- **16.5.** To which extent has alleviation of the effects of drought, natural disasters, warfare, and other forms of insecurity been improved for all areas and social groups?

| | Very High | High | Medium | Low | Very Low | Don't Know |
|---------------|-----------|------|--------|-----|----------|------------|
| 16.1. | | | | | | |
| 16.2. | | | | | | |
| 16.3. | | | | | | |
| 16.4. | | | | | | |
| 16.5. | | | | | | |
| Best Feature: | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |

Most serious problem: